

Volume XII:1 Winter 2012

©2012 by the Yale Journal of Health Policy, Law, and Ethics.
All rights reserved. ISSN 1535-3532.
No Claim to Original U.S. Government Works.

YALE JOURNAL OF HEALTH POLICY, LAW, AND ETHICS

VOLUME XII

WINTER 2012

SUBMISSIONS: We invite the submission of germane manuscripts to the *Yale Journal of Health Policy, Law, and Ethics*. Submissions are accepted on a rolling basis. Please include (1) an electronic copy of the manuscript (double-spaced); (2) your current address, telephone number, email address, and CV; and (3) a 100-word abstract. Submissions should be emailed to yjhple.submissions@yale.edu or submitted via ExpressO or LexOpus. Details about our editorial style are available on our website.

PEER REVIEW: Articles submitted to the *Journal* are peer reviewed. For a detailed description of our peer review process, please visit our website: www.yale.edu/yjhple.

SUBSCRIPTIONS: The *Journal* is published biannually. Subscriptions are \$29 per year for individuals and \$39 for institutions. Institutional rates apply to libraries, law firms, institutions, and individuals whose employer pays for subscriptions. Please add \$10 for overseas mailing.

Claims for non-receipt of issues should be made within 90 days of the month of publication for domestic subscribers and within 180 days for overseas subscribers. Thereafter, the regular back issue rate will be charged for replacement. All subscriptions will be renewed automatically unless the subscriber provides cancellation notice prior to September 1 of each new publication year. Please allow three months for overseas deliveries.

LEGAL NOTICES: The *Journal* is published by the Yale Schools of Law, Medicine, Public Health, and Nursing. The Editorial Staff, with the assistance of the Advisory Board, makes all decisions regarding the content of the *Journal*. Statements of fact and opinion are the sole responsibility of the authors and are not necessarily endorsed by the editors, Yale University, or any of Yale's professional or graduate schools. For permission to photocopy articles or other materials appearing in the *Journal*, contact the Editorial Staff at the address below.

MAILING ADDRESS

*Yale Journal of Health Policy,
Law, and Ethics*
P.O. Box 208215
New Haven, CT 06520-8215

OVERNIGHT DELIVERY ADDRESS

*Yale Journal of Health Policy,
Law, and Ethics*
127 Wall Street
New Haven, CT 06511

www.yale.edu/yjhple Tel: 203.436.0774 E-mail: yjhple@yale.edu

Founding Members

Chetan Gulati, J.D. Leslie A. Meltzer, J.D., M.Sc., Ph.D(c)
Chris Herndon, M.D. Jason Silvers, M.D., J.D.

EXECUTIVE EDITORIAL BOARD

Editors-in-Chief

Daniel M. Isaacs
Anita Viciano

Executive Editors

Carolyn E. Brokowski
Shaun Mahaffy

Managing Editor

Laura Keay

SENIOR EDITORIAL BOARD

Article Editors

Benjamin Himes
Ashley Hopkins
Anna Shabalov
Danielle B. Rosenthal (Note)

Submissions Editors

Laura E. Raposo
Garth Strohbehn
Jamie Brooks, *Notes*

Web Designer

Francis Song

Webmaster

Laura Keay

STAFF EDITORS

Uzma Alam
Hana Akselrod
Ben Albright
Danny Bousquet
Sarah Caruana
Christina Coutu
Lilangi Ediriwickrema
Gloria Jean Gong
Laurie Graham
Paul Guillod
Chelsea Kelly
Dhruv Khullar
Kimberly Kushner
Vanessa Lamers
Sheng Li
Michelle Lu

Elizabeth Mak
Andrea Alvarez Marin
Anjali Motgi
Caroline Ong
Leo Quigley
Kyle Ragins
Ravi Ramanathan
Alix Rogers
Gabe Scheffler
Jared Sun
Chung-Sang Tse
Jane Tucker
Tiffany Ruosi Wang
Jason Yost
Osama Zayyad
Anna L. Zonderman

ADVISORY BOARD

Henry J. Aaron, Ph.D., *Senior Fellow, Brookings Institution*
Lori B. Andrews, J.D., *Professor, Chicago-Kent College of Law*
George J. Annas, J.D., M.P.H., *Professor, Boston University Schools of Law, Medicine, and Public Health*
John D. Arras, Ph.D., *Porterfield Professor of Biomedical Ethics, University of Virginia*
M. Gregg Bloche, M.D., J.D., *Professor of Law, Georgetown University, and Co-Director, Georgetown-Johns Hopkins Joint Program in Law & Public Health*
Troyen A. Brennan, M.A., M.D., J.D., M.P.H., *Executive Vice President and Chief Medical Officer, CVS Caremark*
Scott Burris, J.D., *Professor, Temple University School of Law*
Robert A. Burt, J.D., *Alexander M. Bickel Professor of Law, Yale Law School*
James F. Childress, Ph.D., *Professor, University of Virginia*
Paul D. Cleary, Ph.D., *Dean and C.E.A. Winslow Professor of Epidemiology and Public Health, Yale University School of Public Health*
Ruth R. Faden, Ph.D., M.P.H., *Philip Franklin Wagley Professor of Biomedical Ethics and Director, The Phoebe R. Berman Bioethics Institute, Johns Hopkins University*
John C. Fletcher, Ph.D., *Professor Emeritus, University of Virginia School of Medicine*
Lawrence O. Gostin, J.D., L.L.D., *Professor and Director, Center for Law and the Public's Health, Georgetown and Johns Hopkins Universities*
Christine Grady, R.N., Ph.D., *Head, Section of Human Subjects Research, Department of Clinical Bioethics, National Institutes of Health*
Dean M. Hashimoto, M.D., J.D., M.P.H., *Associate Professor of Law, Boston College, and Chief of Occupational and Environmental Medicine, Massachusetts General Hospital and the Brigham and Women's Hospital*
Timothy S. Jost, J.D., *Robert L. Willett Family Professor of Law, Washington and Lee University School of Law*
Ruth Katz, J.D., M.P.H., *Dean and Walter G. Ross Professor of Health Policy, George Washington University School of Public Health and Health Services*
David Kessler, M.D., J.D., *Dean, University of California, San Francisco School of Medicine, and Former Commissioner of the U.S. Food and Drug Administration*
Alvin K. Klevorick, Ph.D., *John Thomas Smith Professor of Law and Professor of Economics, Yale Law School and Yale University Department of Economics*
C. Everett Koop, M.D., Sc.D., *Senior Scholar, C. Everett Koop Institute at Dartmouth College and Former Surgeon General of the United States*
Stephen R. Latham, J.D., Ph.D., *Deputy Director, Yale's Interdisciplinary Center on Bioethics*
Jerold R. Mande, M.P.H., *Director of Policy Programs, Yale University School of Medicine*
Theodore R. Marmor, Ph.D., *Professor, Yale University School of Management and Yale Law School*
Leslie Meltzer, J.D., M.Sc., *Greenwall Fellow in Bioethics and Health Policy, Georgetown University Law Center and the Johns Hopkins Bloomberg School of Public Health*
Theodore W. Ruger, J.D., *Professor, University of Pennsylvania Law School*
Elyn R. Saks, M.Litt., J.D., *Orrin B. Evans Professor of Law, Psychology, and Psychiatry and the Behavioral Sciences, University of Southern California Gould School of Law*