

# YALE JOURNAL OF HEALTH POLICY, LAW, AND ETHICS

VOLUME XVII

Winter 2017

## EXECUTIVE EDITORIAL BOARD

### *Editors-in-Chief*

Nathan Guevremont

William Hudson

### **Executive Editors**

Susanna D. Evarts

Cynthia Tsay

### **Managing Editors**

Maxwell Farina

Kara Stencel

## SENIOR EDITORIAL BOARD

### **Articles Editors**

Susan Choy

Nora Niedzielski-Eichner

Talya Presser

Micha Sam Brickman Raredon

### **Submissions Editors**

Shoshanna Goldin

Nina Varsava

Medha Vyavahare, *Notes*

## STAFF EDITORS

Emmanuella Asabor

Kirthi Bellamkonda

Rob Boisseau

Danielle Boudreau

Nathan Chai

Chloe Chepigin

Eugenia Custo Greig

Stephanie Doran

Victoria Jane En Long

Andrea Espinoza Kim

Sandra Lynne Fryhofer

Ryan Handoko

Marcus Ihemdi

Keturah James

Juliana Lawrence

Taylor Ottesen

Adam Pan

Ponnu Padiyara

Emily Plumley

Elliott Race

Suhasini Ravi

Taylor Steubs

Allison Taylor

Krysten Thomas

Luke Versten

Weige Zhao

Cheryl Zogg

## ADVISORY BOARD

- Henry J. Aaron, Ph.D., *Senior Fellow, Brookings Institution*
- Lori B. Andrews, J.D., *Distinguished Professor of Law and Director of the Institute for Science, Law and Technology, Chicago-Kent College of Law*
- George J. Annas, J.D., M.P.H., *Professor, Boston University Schools of Law, Medicine, and Public Health*
- M. Gregg Bloche, M.D., J.D., *Professor of Law, Georgetown University, and Co-Director, Georgetown-Johns Hopkins Joint Program in Law & Public Health*
- Troyen A. Brennan, M.A., M.D., J.D., M.P.H., *Executive Vice President and Chief Medical Officer, CVS Caremark*
- Scott Burris, J.D., *Professor, Temple University School of Law*
- James F. Childress, Ph.D., *Professor, University of Virginia*
- Paul D. Cleary, Ph.D., *Dean and C.E.A. Winslow Professor of Epidemiology and Public Health, Yale University School of Public Health*
- Ruth R. Faden, Ph.D., M.P.H., *Philip Franklin Wagley Professor of Biomedical Ethics and Director, The Phoebe R. Berman Bioethics Institute, Johns Hopkins University*
- Lawrence O. Gostin, J.D., L.L.D., *Professor and Director, Center for Law and the Public's Health, Georgetown and Johns Hopkins Universities*
- Christine Grady, R.N., Ph.D., *Head, Section of Human Subjects Research, Department of Clinical Bioethics, National Institutes of Health*
- Dean M. Hashimoto, M.D., J.D., M.P.H., *Associate Professor of Law, Boston College, and Chief of Occupational and Environmental Medicine, Massachusetts General Hospital and the Brigham and Women's Hospital*
- Timothy S. Jost, J.D., *Robert L. Willett Family Professor of Law, Washington and Lee University School of Law*
- Ruth Katz, J.D., M.P.H., *Director, Health, Medicine and Society, Aspen Institute*
- David Kessler, M.D., J.D., *Dean, University of California, San Francisco School of Medicine, and Former Commissioner of the U.S. Food and Drug Administration*
- Alvin K. Klevorick, Ph.D., *John Thomas Smith Professor of Law and Deputy Dean of Yale Law School, Professor, Yale University Department of Economics*
- Stephen R. Latham, J.D., Ph.D., *Deputy Director, Yale's Interdisciplinary Center on Bioethics*
- Jerold R. Mandel, M.P.H., *Director of Policy Programs, Yale University School of Medicine*
- Theodore R. Marmor, Ph.D., *Professor, Yale University School of Management and Yale Law School*
- Leslie Meltzer, J.D., M.Sc., *Greenwall Fellow in Bioethics and Health Policy, Georgetown University Law Center and the Johns Hopkins Bloomberg School of Public Health*
- Theodore W. Ruger, J.D., *Bernard G. Segal Professor of Law and Dean, University of Pennsylvania Law School*
- Elyn R. Saks, M.Litt., J.D., *Orrin B. Evans Professor of Law, Psychology, and Psychiatry and the Behavioral Sciences, University of Southern California Gould School of Law*
- Michael H. Shapiro, M.A., J.D., *Dorothy W. Nelson Professor of Law, University of Southern California Gould School of Law*

YALE JOURNAL OF HEALTH POLICY, LAW, AND ETHICS

---

VOLUME XVII

Summer 2017

---

EXECUTIVE EDITORIAL BOARD

*Editors-in-Chief*

Susanna D. Evarts  
Nathan Guevremont

**Executive Editors**

Adam Pan  
Cynthia Tsay

**Managing Editors**

Maxwell Farina  
Ike Lee

SENIOR EDITORIAL BOARD

**Articles Editors**

Susan Choy  
Nora Niedzielski-Eichner  
Talya Presser  
Suhasini Ravi

**Submissions Editors**

Stephanie Doran  
Nina Varsava  
Medha Vyavahare, *Notes*

STAFF EDITORS

Krysten Thomas  
Weige Zhao Robert Boisseau  
Chloe Chipigin  
Nathan Chai  
Eugenia Custo Greig  
Ponnu Ann Padiyara

## ADVISORY BOARD

- Henry J. Aaron, Ph.D., *Senior Fellow, Brookings Institution*
- Lori B. Andrews, J.D., *Distinguished Professor of Law and Director of the Institute for Science, Law and Technology, Chicago-Kent College of Law*
- George J. Annas, J.D., M.P.H., *Professor, Boston University Schools of Law, Medicine, and Public Health*
- M. Gregg Bloche, M.D., J.D., *Professor of Law, Georgetown University, and Co-Director, Georgetown-Johns Hopkins Joint Program in Law & Public Health*
- Troyen A. Brennan, M.A., M.D., J.D., M.P.H., *Executive Vice President and Chief Medical Officer, CVS Caremark*
- Scott Burris, J.D., *Professor, Temple University School of Law*
- James F. Childress, Ph.D., *Professor, University of Virginia*
- Paul D. Cleary, Ph.D., *Dean and C.E.A. Winslow Professor of Epidemiology and Public Health, Yale University School of Public Health*
- Ruth R. Faden, Ph.D., M.P.H., *Philip Franklin Wagley Professor of Biomedical Ethics and Director, The Phoebe R. Berman Bioethics Institute, Johns Hopkins University*
- Lawrence O. Gostin, J.D., L.L.D., *Professor and Director, Center for Law and the Public's Health, Georgetown and Johns Hopkins Universities*
- Christine Grady, R.N., Ph.D., *Head, Section of Human Subjects Research, Department of Clinical Bioethics, National Institutes of Health*
- Dean M. Hashimoto, M.D., J.D., M.P.H., *Associate Professor of Law, Boston College, and Chief of Occupational and Environmental Medicine, Massachusetts General Hospital and the Brigham and Women's Hospital*
- Timothy S. Jost, J.D., *Robert L. Willett Family Professor of Law, Washington and Lee University School of Law*
- Ruth Katz, J.D., M.P.H., *Director, Health, Medicine and Society, Aspen Institute*
- David Kessler, M.D., J.D., *Dean, University of California, San Francisco School of Medicine, and Former Commissioner of the U.S. Food and Drug Administration*
- Alvin K. Klevorick, Ph.D., *John Thomas Smith Professor of Law and Deputy Dean of Yale Law School, Professor, Yale University Department of Economics*
- Stephen R. Latham, J.D., Ph.D., *Deputy Director, Yale's Interdisciplinary Center on Bioethics*
- Jerold R. Mande, M.P.H., *Director of Policy Programs, Yale University School of Medicine*
- Theodore R. Marmor, Ph.D., *Professor, Yale University School of Management and Yale Law School*
- Leslie Meltzer, J.D., M.Sc., *Greenwall Fellow in Bioethics and Health Policy, Georgetown University Law Center and the Johns Hopkins Bloomberg School of Public Health*
- Theodore W. Ruger, J.D., *Bernard G. Segal Professor of Law and Dean, University of Pennsylvania Law School*
- Elyn R. Saks, M.Litt., J.D., *Orrin B. Evans Professor of Law, Psychology, and Psychiatry and the Behavioral Sciences, University of Southern California Gould School of Law*
- Michael H. Shapiro, M.A., J.D., *Dorothy W. Nelson Professor of Law, University of Southern California Gould School of Law*